



MANIPAL
ACADEMY of HIGHER EDUCATION

(Deemed to be University under Section 3 of the UGC Act, 1956)

Centre for Religious Studies

Manipal Centre for Humanities

Buddhist Pramāṇa Workshop

February 10-12 2019

Participant Handbook



About the Workshop

The workshop will principally include a close textual reading of selections from various texts of the Buddhist Pramāṇa Tradition each followed by various contributions and discussions. We will read the extracts from the following texts:

- *Nyāyabindu* of Dharmakīrti with the *Ṭīkā* of Dharmottara: first chapter (*Pratyakṣa-pariccheda*)
Led by Prof Pradeep Gokhale
- *Vātsīputrīyātmaparīkṣā* (= *Tattvasaṃgraha* of Śāntarakṣita verses 336-349, and the corresponding *Tattvasaṃgraha-pañjikā* of Kamalaśīla)
Led by Prof Francesco Sferra
- *Pramāṇāntarabhāvaparīkṣā* (= *Tattvasaṃgraha* of Śāntarakṣita verses 1486-1524, and the corresponding *Tattvasaṃgraha-pañjikā* of Kamalaśīla)
Led by Prof Francesco Sferra

The aim is to examine how the Buddhist Pramāṇa Tradition systematically develops its logical-epistemological tools. The workshop expects to delve into extensive philosophical discussions while at the same time working closely with the textual sources adopting philological methods. This is possible by focusing on small portions of texts mentioned above and attempting to situate the philosophical problems in larger discussions taking help from experts. The workshop will begin by asking how Nāgārjuna's (c. 150-250 CE) dialectics in his works like the *Mūlamadhyamakakārikā* and the *Vigrahavyāvartanī* become a source of many logical arguments or how Dharmakīrti (f. c. 6th or 7th CE) in his works such as the *Nyāyabindu*, the *Pramāṇaviniścaya* and the *Pramāṇavārtika* elaborates and clarifies Dinnāga's (c. 480-540 CE) Theory of Knowledge. Thereafter, the problem at focus will be how Śāntarakṣita (c. 725–788 CE) in his *Tattvasaṃgraha* and Kamalaśīla (c. 740-795 CE) in his commentary on the same text titled the *Tattvasaṃgraha-pañjikā* deal with the concepts of Self and Verbal Testimony.

About MCH

Manipal Centre for Humanities (MCH) is a leading research and teaching institute based in Manipal, Karnataka. It offers an undergraduate program in Humanities and postgraduate programs in English and Sociology, alongside a doctoral program in Humanities.

As one of the most exciting academic experiments in higher education in India, MCH fosters a culture of innovative and reflexive pedagogy, intellectual freedom, student initiatives, and new directions in scholarship. Students come to MCH from universities abroad and many of India's premier undergraduate colleges. Many MCH alumni have gone on to have successful careers in media, publishing, education, social sector, corporate sector, and arts management. Students have also been accepted to doctoral programs at prestigious international universities. In 2016, four new Centres were set up within MCH to encourage research and activities in specific areas of interest -- the Centre for Religious Studies, Hebbur Gallery and Art Centre, the Centre for Women's Studies, and the Centre for Cultural History. The Centre for Religious Studies was envisioned as a first-of-its-kind department in India with the objective of facilitating critical conversations and engagements with the development of religious thought over different historical periods and contexts, as well as showcasing the changing relevance of these insights in contemporary society.



Workshop Schedule

Day 1 - February 10 (Sunday)

09:00 AM - 09:30 AM	Introductory Session
09:30 AM - 11:00 AM	Lecture by Professor Francesco Sferra (Topic: "Śāntarakṣita and Kamalaśīla vs the Buddhist Personalist view-point")
11:00 AM - 11:30 AM	Tea
11:30 AM - 01:30 PM	Text Session (<i>Vātsīputrīyātmaparīkṣā</i> (= <i>Tattvasaṃgraha</i> 336-349, and the corresponding <i>Tattvasaṃgraha-pañjikā</i>) (Professor Francesco Sferra)
01:30 PM - 02:30 PM	Lunch and Rest
02:30 PM - 05:30 PM	Text Session (<i>Vātsīputrīyātmaparīkṣā</i> (= <i>Tattvasaṃgraha</i> 336-349, and the corresponding <i>Tattvasaṃgraha-pañjikā</i>) (Professor Francesco Sferra)
05:30 PM	Tea

Day 2 - February 11 (Monday)

09:00 AM - 11:00 AM	Lecture by Professor Francesco Sferra (Topic: "Śāntarakṣita and Kamalaśīla on Verbal Testimony")
11:00 AM - 11:30 AM	Tea
11:30 AM - 01:30 AM	Lecture by Professor Pradeep Gokhale (Topic: "Nāgārjuna's Ways of Argumentation: Some Logical Issues")
01:30 PM - 02:30 PM	Lunch and Rest
02:30 PM - 05:00 PM	Text Session (<i>Nyāyabindu-ṭīkā-Pratyakṣa-pariccheda</i>) (Professor Pradeep Gokhale)
05:00 PM - 05:30 PM	Tea
05:30 PM - 07:30 PM	Text Session (<i>Pramāṇāntarabhāvaparīkṣā</i> (= <i>Tattvasaṃgraha</i> 1486-1524, and the corresponding <i>Tattvasaṃgraha-pañjikā</i>) (Professor Francesco Sferra)

Day 3 - February 12 (Tuesday)

09:00 AM - 11:00 AM	Text Session (<i>Pramāṇāntarabhāvaparīkṣā</i> (= <i>Tattvasaṃgraha</i> 1486-1524, and the corresponding <i>Tattvasaṃgraha-pañjikā</i>) (Professor Francesco Sferra)
11:00 AM - 11:30 AM	Tea
11:30 AM - 01:30 AM	Lecture by Professor Pradeep Gokhale (Topic: "The Epistemology of Dinnāga and Dharmakīrti")
01:30 PM - 02:30 PM	Lunch and Rest
02:30 PM - 05:00 PM	Text Session (<i>Nyāyabindu-ṭīkā-Pratyakṣa-pariccheda</i>) (Professor Pradeep Gokhale)
05:00 PM - 05:30 PM	Tea
05:30 PM - 07:30 PM	Text Session (<i>Pramāṇāntarabhāvaparīkṣā</i> (= <i>Tattvasaṃgraha</i> 1486-1524, and the corresponding <i>Tattvasaṃgraha-pañjikā</i>) (Professor Francesco Sferra)

Resource Persons

Pradeep P. Gokhale retired in January 2012 as Professor from the Department of Philosophy, University of Pune after 31 years of teaching. From January 2012 to January 2018 he worked as 'Dr. B. R. Ambedkar Research Professor' in the Central Institute of Higher Tibetan Studies, Sarnath (Varanasi). Presently he is associated with the Department of Pali as well as the Department of Philosophy of Savitribai Phule Pune University, as 'Honorary Adjunct Professor'. He is the author of *Inference and Fallacies Discussed in Ancient Indian Logic* (1992), *Vādanyāya of Dharmakīrti: The Logic of Debate* (1993), *Hetubindu of Dharmakīrti: A Point on Probans* (1997), and *Lokāyata/Cārvāka: A Philosophical Inquiry* (2015). He has co-edited *Studies in Indian Moral Philosophy: Problems, Concepts and Perspectives* (2002) and edited *The Philosophy of Dr. B. R. Ambedkar* (2008). Major areas in which his research articles are published are Classical Indian Philosophy, Indian Epistemology and Logic, Indian Moral Philosophy, Social Philosophy and Philosophy of Religion.

Francesco Sferra is full professor of Sanskrit language and literature at the Università degli Studi di Napoli "L'Orientale", Italy, where he has been teaching for the last 20 years. His primary areas of expertise are Sanskrit philology, history of Indian religions, tantric studies, and classical Indian philosophy of language. In 2007 and in 2011-2012 he was visiting professor (Numata-Professor für Buddhismuskunde) at the Asien-Afrika-Institut (Universität Hamburg). Since 2006 he has directed an international research project for the critical edition and study of unpublished Buddhist works in Sanskrit. He has published the critical edition and translation of the longer *Ṣaḍaṅgayoga* by Anupamarakṣita with its commentary by Raviśrījñāna (2000), the *Sekoddeśaṭīkā* by Nāropā (2006) and (together with H. Isaacson) the *Sekanirdeśapañjikā* by Rāmapāla (2014). He is the founder and co-editor of the series *Manuscripta Buddhica* (first vol. 2008).

Lecture Abstracts

February 10 (Sunday)

9:30 - 11:00 AM

Śāntarakṣita and Kamalaśīla *vs* the Buddhist Personalist view-point
Prof. Francesco Sferra

The last part of the *Tattvasaṃgraha* section dedicated to the criticism of the Self (*Ātmaparīkṣā*) is deliberately retained for the refutation of the Pudgalavādins' point of view, the personalists within the Buddhist tradition. Śāntarakṣita and Kamalaśīla are engaged in a double confrontation: on the one hand they have to reduce the theses of their adversaries to the absurd, through exquisitely logical arguments. On the other, they must offer an alternative and 'orthodox' explanation of the scriptural passages quoted by the latter in support of their thesis. The result is a complex debate that draws upon other texts and authors, both Buddhist and non-Buddhist.

February 11 (Monday)

9:00 - 11:00 AM

Śāntarakṣita and Kamalaśīla on Verbal Testimony
Prof. Francesco Sferra

Following Diñnāga and Dharmakīrti, Śāntarakṣita and Kamalaśīla reduce the means of valid knowledge to two, *perception* and *inference*. The *verbal testimony* is explained by the mechanisms of *inference* and by appealing to the "desire to speak", conceived as a logical reason. In particular, the two masters criticise the position of Kumārila Bhaṭṭa, who had offered the most sophisticated defence of verbal cognition and *verbal testimony* as a means of knowledge in itself.

11:30 - 01:30 AM

Nāgārjuna's Ways of Argumentation: Some Logical Issues
Prof. Pradeep Gokhale

Nāgārjuna's argumentation in his works *Mūlamadhyamakakārikā* and *Vigrahavyāvartanī* becomes a source of many logical issues. The talk will deal with some of the major logical issues that arise from Nāgārjuna's argumentation. The logical issues arising from Nāgārjuna's argumentation can be broadly classified into four major types, which, of course, occur in an interconnected way:

- (A) Does the Catuṣkoṭi format adopted by Nāgārjuna amount to transgression of classical logic?
- (B) What is the nature of Nāgārjuna's negation ('Mādhyamika negation')?
- (C) Has Nāgārjuna committed logical errors in his presentation?
- (D) The issue of Nāgārjuna's methodology.

These issues will be explained in brief and discussed in the talk. An attempt will be made in the talk to develop a certain perspective on these issues.

February 12 (Tuesday)

11:30 - 01:30 AM

The Epistemology of Diñnāga and Dharmakīrti

Prof. Pradeep Gokhale

Diñnāga and Dharmakīrti are the two pioneering figures of the Buddhist Epistemology. Dharmakīrti belongs to the teacher-disciple tradition of Diñnāga. There are some common features in their epistemologies. Dharmakīrti in his works such as the *Nyāyabindu*, the *Pramāṇaviniścaya* and the *Pramāṇavārtika* elaborates and clarifies Diñnāga's Theory of Knowledge. But he also develops over it, revises it and some of his revisions are radical departures from Diñnāga's views. An attempt will be made in this talk to sketch out the contributions of Diñnāga and Dharmakīrti to the Theory of Pramāṇa and to highlight the development made by Dharmakīrti over Diñnāga's Theory of Pramāṇa, particularly his Theory of Inference.

Frequently Asked Questions

Q. Where will the workshop be held?

A. The event will be hosted by Manipal Academy of Higher Education and its Centre for Religious Studies in the picturesque ocean-side state of Karnataka in south-western India.

Q. How do I reach Manipal?

A. Manipal is well connected by road, rail and air. There are two main cities close to Manipal that serve as entry points- Udupi and Mangalore. Udupi is 5 kms from Manipal and Mangalore 65 kms away. The nearest airport is at Mangalore which is one and half hours drive by road. There are daily domestic flights from Mumbai and Bangalore. Indian Airlines and Jet Airways fly to Mangalore. There are direct international flights to Mangalore from Dubai, Abu Dhabi, Muscat, Doha-Qatar, Bahrain and Kuwait. Prepaid taxis are available at the Mangalore airport. Buses run between Mangalore and Manipal frequently. Direct buses are also available from Bangalore, Goa, Hyderabad, Mumbai and other cities. The nearest railway stations are at Udupi (2 kms from Manipal) and Mangalore (65 kms from Manipal).

Q. Is there anything I should know about the weather?

A. In February, the weather in Manipal is tropical with daily temperatures averaging 27 °C (81 °F). As it is situated 8 km away from the Arabian sea, the weather is typically humid through the year.

Q. What are the places of interest in and around Manipal?

A. Manipal is 2 km away from Udupi, the birthplace of Dvaita Vedānta, where the Udupi Sri Krishna Matha, founded by Madhvāchārya is open to visitors on all days of the week. Manipal is also within close distance (approx. 8 km) of the western coast of India, and the western ghats (approx. 50-60 km). For a more comprehensive guide, please visit <https://manipal.edu/mu/about-us/international-collaborations/area-of-attractions-nearby.html>



For further queries, contact

Dr. Mrinal Kaul
Workshop Convenor
mrinal.kaul@manipal.edu
Tel - +91-820-29-23567 Extn: 23567

Mr. Nikhil Ravishanker
Workshop Co-convenor
nikhil.ravishankar@gmail.com
Tel - +91-7349661351

Manipal Centre for Humanities
Dr. TMA Pai Planetarium Complex,
Alevoor Road, Manipal-576104
Tel - 0820 292 3561 | office.mcph@manipal.edu

manipal.edu/mch | themchblog.wordpress.com